

CONSTITUENT ASSEMBLY (LEGISLATURE)

Friday, the 5th March, 1948

The Constituent Assembly (Legislature) met in the Assembly Chamber, Karachi, at Ten of the Clock, Mr. Deputy President (Mr. Tamizuddin Khan) in the Chair.

STARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

(a) ORAL ANSWERS

LICENCES FOR RUNNING AIR SERVICES IN PAKISTAN

1. *Alhajj Muhammed Hashim Gazder : Will the Honourable Minister for Communications please state :

(a) the number of licences granted for running air services in Pakistan and the companies to whom these have been granted, and what are the terms of licences ;

(b) the Air routes for which such licences have been granted ;

(c) the number of regular applications received and on what dates ;

(d) the number of applications rejected and on what grounds ;

(e) the reasons for the Government limiting licences to only two companies ;

(f) whether it is the policy of the Government to establish monopolies of these companies, and if so, why ;

(g) the names of Directors and Managing Agents referred to in (a) above ; and

(h) whether any person referred to in (g) above is related to any Honourable Minister of Pakistan ?

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : (a) Only one licence has so far been granted for running Air Services in Pakistan. This has been granted to M/s. Orient Airways, Ltd. On the termination of the Standstill Agreement with India, there was only one company registered in Pakistan, *i.e.*, Orient Airways, Ltd., and that company was given licence temporarily for three months which expired on the 31st December, 1947, and had to be extended for another period of three months because final decision about the policy was not taken.

(b) The routes for which licence has been given are :—

(1) Karachi-Lahore-Rawalpindi-Peshawar.

(2) Karachi-Quetta-Lahore.

(3) Karachi-Delhi-Dacca.

(4) Dacca-Calcutta-Chittagong-Akyab-Rangoon.

(5) Karachi-Bombay.

(c) A statement is placed on the table of the House.

(d) None. The latter part of the question does not arise.

A Board presided over by an *ex-High Court Judge* has now been set up to consider the applications for grant of fresh licences and to advise the Government.

(e) The Government have decided to license only two companies in view of the fact that the traffic potential in Pakistan is low. There do not exist any great industrial centres either in West or in East Pakistan which may generate commercial traffic. On the trunk routes connecting East and West Pakistan, the Pakistan air companies will have to compete with Indian companies and on external routes, competition from international operators will have to be faced. Even on the purely internal routes, the traffic has to be built up gradually. Moreover it will be dangerous to allow mushroom companies to operate because it will lead to inefficiency, dissipation of technical personnel, waste of public money and exposing the people to various dangers. The policy has been adopted carefully so that the private companies may be able to establish themselves on sound commercial basis and pay their own way.

(f) It is not the intention of the Government to establish monopolies. Other companies besides the two licensed companies will be permitted to operate non-scheduled services.

(g) The Directors of the Orient Airways are :

- (1) Mirza Ahmad Ispahani.
- (2) Mr. Mohd. Rafi Ispahani.
- (3) Sir Maratib Ali.
- (4) Maharaja of Mahmudabad.
- (5) The Honourable Khan Iftikhar Husain Khan of Mamdot.
- (6) The Honourable Mr. M. A. Khuhro.
- (7) Maulvi Mohd. Amin.
- (8) Mr. Mohamedali Habib.
- (9) Shezada Najmuddin.
- (10) Khan Bahadur Abdul Karim Baboo Khan.
- (11) Malik Firoz Khan Noon.
- (12) Mr. Vali Mohamed Kasim Dada.

(h) No.

Statement showing names of Applicants and dates of receipt of Applications

Name	Date of Receipt
1. Pakistan Mercantile Corporation, Ltd., Karachi 31-1-1948.
2. Orient Airways, Ltd., Calcutta 31-1-1948.
3. Islamic Airways Agencies, Ltd. 31-1-1948.
4. East Bengal Traders, Dacca 4-2-1948.

Alhaji Muhammed Hashim Gazder : I would ask under (a) what were the terms of the licence ? The class of licence is not mentioned.

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : The Honourable Member should see the Rules which are published and are available to the public.

Mr. Mohammed Ali : Will the Honourable Member please state if there is any regular chartered service operating between the two Dominions ?

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : I have already mentioned that permission was given to the Orient Airways to operate on the Karachi-Bombay route. Unfortunately it has not so far been possible for them to operate upon this route.

Mr. Mohammed Ali : I was referring to chartered service. There is a chartered service between Calcutta and Dacca which is operated by the Dalmia Jain Airways under two different names. Will the Honourable Minister please state whether the necessary permission was granted to the service ?

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : I believe, Sir, that there is a little bit of misunderstanding about this matter. So far as we are concerned we give licences for scheduled services. So far as the chartered service is concerned if a Company has got sufficient aircraft and they want to fly it we allow people to do chartered service. As far as possible any company that is prepared to come forward can get the licence.

The Honourable Mr. Hamidul Huq Chowdhury : Is there any regular chartered service operating at present ?

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : No, Sir.

Alhaji Muhammed Hashim Gazder : Is a subsidy in any shape paid to the Orient Airways ?

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : No, Sir.

Mr. Prem Hari Barma : Will the Honourable Minister please state whether Government contemplate nationalizing the Air Services in Pakistan ?

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : I would draw the attention of the Honourable Member, Sir, to the declaration that was made by the Pakistan Government, so far as the question of policy is concerned. Therein it was clearly stated that at present in the interests of the development of Air Services, Government intend to allow private companies to operate air services, but the ultimate aim of the Government is and will be the nationalization of the Air Services.

SCARCITY OF CLOTH IN EAST BENGAL.

2. *Prof. Raj Kumar Chakraverty : (a) Will the Honourable Minister for Commerce, Industries and Works be pleased to state if there is a scarcity of cloth in East Bengal and that the people are suffering on that account ?

(b) If so, what steps do Government propose to take, and have already taken, to cope with the situation ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : (a) Government are aware of the scarcity of cloth in East Bengal. Various causes including the inability of the Bengal Textile Association to arrange supplies and the refusal of the Government of India to allow the Government of East Bengal to set up their own organization to lift the quota of East Bengal and distribute it in their own area are responsible for this scarcity. People of East Bengal are put to

some inconvenience by the dislocation of arrangements for supply, but the Government of East Bengal are taking the necessary steps to reduce the inconveniences.

(b) Apart from representations made to the Government of India on a number of occasions which, however, did not always bear fruit, efforts are being made to obtain cloth from sources other than India.

Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta : Will the Honourable Minister please tell us what are the requirements of the people of East Bengal, so far as cloth is concerned ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : The requirements of East Bengal were put down at 92,000 bales for the period August, 1947 to January, 1948.

Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta : Will the Honourable Minister please tell us how many textile mills are in East Bengal ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : Five.

Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta : Will the Honourable Minister please tell us what is the amount of production of these textile mills ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : I want notice of the question.

Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta : Will the Honourable Minister please tell us what is the state of things with regard to the production of these textile mills ? Does the cloth produced by these mills remain in East Bengal or is it allowed to be exported ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : No cloth produced by mills in East Bengal is allowed to be exported.

The Honourable Mr. Hamidul Huq Chowdhury : Will the Honourable Minister please state at what rate of calculation has the figure of 92,000 bales been fixed for six months ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : That was according to the ration and the quota fixed in pre-partition days.

The Honourable Mr. Hamidul Huq Chowdhury : Was this figure arrived at by the Pakistan Government or was it fixed by the Government of the Union of India ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : The Government of India had fixed the allocation for Bengal in pre-partition India. After the division of Bengal the Government of India, from whom these bales of cloth had to be obtained, took up the matter again and made allocations to West and East Bengal on population basis.

The Honourable Mr. Hamidul Huq Chowdhury : Is the Honourable Minister aware that at the rate of 12 yards per head which has been fixed for Bengal the figure of bales imported from outside comes to 23,000 bales, apart from what it gets from its own mills ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : The figures worked out by the Government of India show according to my recollection—I speak subject to correction—about 17,000 bales.

Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta : Will the Honourable Minister please tell us whether the scarcity is due to the policy of control that is maintained in East Bengal ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : The policy of control cannot produce scarcity. The scarcity is due to inadequate supplies.

Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta : Will the Honourable Minister be pleased to tell us whether the tariff barriers that have been imposed now will increase the scarcity ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : The tariff barriers will not have any effect one way or the other, because, so far as textiles are concerned, no transport from one Province to another or from one Dominion to another was possible, as separate allocation was made to each particular Province.

The Honourable Mr. Hamidul Huq Chowdhury : Will the Honourable Minister be pleased to tell whether the quantity of cloth which has not been delivered by the West Bengal Government to East Bengal Government will be delivered to them ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : That is a matter which we have taken up with the Government of India and the decision is awaited.

Prof. Raj Kumar Chakraverty : Will the Honourable Member tell us what are the other sources from which attempts are being made to get further supply of cloth and the time when we will get those supplies ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : Attempts are being made to obtain textiles from the United Kingdom, from Holland and from Italy but there is scarcity in all these countries and we can only hope for the best.

Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta : Will the Honourable Member be pleased to state whether it is a fact that large quantities of cloth that is produced in Dextra Cotton Mills and Lakirarain Cotton Mills lie undistributed on account of the fact that the East Bengal Government is not in a position to pay for them ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : I have not seen any complaints of that character.

The Honourable Mr. Hamidul Huq Chowdhury : Is it a fact that there was representation made by the Government of East Bengal for releasing this cloth but this could not be done on account of the freezing order which is still in operation ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : Releases have been made as soon as the increases in the rates for textile cloth were announced and it is now for the Provincial Government to allocate it to the various districts of East Bengal.

The Honourable Mr. Hamidul Huq Chowdhury : My point is, Sir, whether the freezing order has been responsible for the detention of this cloth and not the inability of East Bengal Government to pay for them.

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : I have already replied that there has never been an allegation that the East Bengal Government was unable to pay and therefore in between the time when the freezing order was issued and up to the time when the prices were fixed the freezing order was responsible for the delay.

The Honourable Mr. Hamidul Huq Chowdhury : Is the Honourable Member aware that the Government of East Bengal have been pressing upon the Central Government of Pakistan as also upon the B.T.A. that their quota ought to be delivered and that they have been doing this for five months ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : That is a fact.

Mr. H. S. Suhrawardy : Is the Honourable Member aware that experience has shown that inefficient control causes commodities to disappear whereas de-control brings the commodities to the surface?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : That is not so in the case of articles in short supply. Where the articles are fairly abundant in supply that is true.

Mr. H. S. Suhrawardy : There is no necessity for control in such cases.

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : There is no necessity for control when the articles are in abundant supply.

ALLEGED MISBEHAVIOUR OF DISTRICT TRAFFIC MANAGER, PAKSEY, WITH HIS SUBORDINATE STAFF

3. ***Mr. Abdulla-al Mahmood :** Will the Honourable Minister for Communications be pleased to state :

(a) Whether he is aware—

(i) that an incident took place at Paksey, a District Headquarters in the Eastern Pakistan Railway, on the 13th December, 1947, at the alleged misbehaviour of the District Traffic Manager, Paksey, with his subordinate staff on a matter arising out of non-supply of food-stuffs ;

(ii) that sixteen poor and innocent subordinate employees of the Paksey District have been illegally and unjustly suspended at the instance and by the orders of the District Traffic Manager and Assistant Traffic Superintendent, Paksey, from the 15th December, 1947 ; and

(iii) that those officers are still under suspension ;

(b) whether his attention has been drawn to a statement which appeared in the issue of the 30th January, 1948, of the *Spokesman*, an Independent Labour Organ, printed and published in Calcutta in connection with the above incident ; and

(c) if the answers to (a) and (b) are in the affirmative the steps, if any, Government propose to take against those officers ? If not, why not ?

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : (a) (i) Some staff are reported to have created a disturbance at Paksey on the 13th December, 1947, not because of the alleged misbehaviour of the Deputy Traffic Manager but because of the demand for full quota of whole rice and sugar.

(ii) Sixteen of the staff who were identified as having taken a leading part in the disturbance were put under suspension by order of the administration from 15th December, 1947, pending an official enquiry. Government do not accept that they were illegally or unjustly suspended ;

(iii) No. As a result of the enquiry, six employees were informed that their services were no longer required and the remaining ten put back to duty from 24th February, 1948.

(b) Government have not seen the statement referred to by the Honourable Member.

(c) In view of my replies for (a) and (b) above, the question of taking any action against the two officers mentioned does not arise.

SUDDEN TRANSFER OF SUBORDINATE STAFF FROM SAIDPUR TO CHITTAGONG

4. *Mr. Abdulla al Mahmood : Will the Honourable Minister for Communication be pleased to state :

(a) whether a large number of permanent employees of the subordinate staff have all of a sudden been transferred from Saidpur to Chittagong, and have been put in the supernumerary list;

(b) if the answer to (a) above be in the affirmative, what action, if any, Government propose to take to revise the order ?

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : (a) No. Some surplus mechanical staff at Saidpur, who were inhabitants of Pahartali (Chittagong), asked for their transfer to Pahartali. The Chief Mechanical Engineer of the E. B. Railway acceded to their request.

(b) Does not arise.

EXTENSION OF TELEPHONE CONNECTIONS TO BAKARGANJ DISTRICT IN EASTERN PAKISTAN

5. *Mr. Azizuddin Ahmad : Will the Honourable Minister for Communications please state as to when it will be possible for the Government to extend telephone connections to the District of Bakarganj in Eastern Pakistan.

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : It is presumed that the Honourable Member has in mind the provision of telephone facilities at Barisal, the Headquarters of Bakarganj District. Provision of telephone facilities at this place involve either the laying down of a river cable or erection of 100 miles of copper wire loop. We are very deficient in stores at the moment but the needs of Barisal will be kept in view in the plan of development for Eastern Pakistan.

CONTEMPLATED PROVISION OF RAILWAY COMMUNICATIONS IN BAKARGANJ DISTRICT IN EASTERN PAKISTAN

6. *Mr. Azizuddin Ahmad : Will the Honourable Minister for Communications please state if the Government contemplate in the near future providing Railway communications in the District of Bakarganj in Eastern Pakistan ?

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : No, Sir.

CONTROL OF I.G.N. AND R.S.N. SHIPPING COMPANIES PLYING IN EASTERN PAKISTAN

7. *Mr. Azizuddin Ahmad : Will the Honourable Minister for Commerce, Industries and Works please state the policy of the Pakistan Government regarding the control of the British Shipping Companies, viz., I.G.N. and R.S.N. Companies which ply in Eastern Pakistan ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : The question is ambiguous, and it is difficult to understand what control the Honourable Member has in mind. The policy of Pakistan Government regarding foreign investments will soon be announced and it is hoped that the statement of policy will satisfy the enquiry of the Honourable Member.

Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta : Will the Honourable Member be pleased to tell us when Government contemplates to take control of these companies ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : This is a matter which will be considered in due course.

TRAINING OF PAKISTAN NATIONALS IN MERCANTILE MARINE AND MARINE ENGINEERING

8. ***Mr. Azizuddin Ahmad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Commerce, Industries and Works please state the arrangements, if any, that have been made by the Pakistan Government for the training of Pakistan nationals in the Mercantile Marine and in Marine Engineering ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : Prior to partition, Merchant Navy cadets from all over India were trained in the I.M.M.T.S. *Dufferin*, Bombay, in both executive and engineering courses. This training ship was retained by the Government of India at the time of partition ; but it was agreed that cadets from Pakistan areas who were receiving training in the ship at the time of partition should continue to do so until the completion of their course and that 12 candidates from Pakistan should be admitted annually for the next three years, six for executive and six for the Engineering course. This arrangement can be extended up to five years if desired by the Pakistan Government.

2. The question of establishing a similar institution in Pakistan is under the active consideration of Government.

ISSUE OF COMMERCIAL PUBLICATIONS IN BENGALI

9. ***Mr. Azizuddin Ahmad :** Will the Honourable Minister for Commerce, Industries and Works please state what steps, if any, have been taken by the Government to issue commercial publications ? If so, are there any such publications in Bengali for the benefit of those who do not know any other language *except* Bengali ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : The Office of the Economic Adviser in the Ministry of Commerce, Industries and Works has been publishing regularly since the 3rd November, 1947, a weekly leaflet entitled " Trade Enquiries " in English. Arrangements are also in hand for the publication of :

- (1) Pakistan Trade Journal (Fortnightly).
- (2) Hand Book of Commercial Information.
- (3) Trade Directory (six monthly), and
- (4) Reports on Overseas Trade.

2. Pakistan Trade Journal and Trade Directory are expected to be out in about a month's time.

3. All the above publications are proposed to be issued in English only in the immediate future. There is no demand for any such publications in any other language.

TRADE RELATIONS OF PAKISTAN GOVERNMENT WITH INDONESIAN REPUBLIC

10. *Mr. Nur Ahmed : Will the Honourable Minister for Commerce, Industries and Works be pleased to state, if any step has been taken by the Government to establish trade relations with the Government of Indonesian Republic ? If so, what are the terms of the trade agreement made ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : No trade agreement exists with the Indonesian Republic at present, but we are anxious to establish the closest economic relations with it as soon as circumstances permit.

INDO-PAKISTAN POSTAL AGREEMENT

11. *Mr. Nur Ahmed : Will the Honourable Minister for Communications be pleased to state, what steps have been taken by the Government of Pakistan to conclude a postal agreement with the Government of India with a view to avoid postal irregularities. If none, why ?

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : The postal irregularities and delays are not attributable to the lack of any postal agreement with the Government of India. The Standstill Agreement concluded at the time of partition expires on the 31st March, 1948. Arrangements are already being made for concluding a revised agreement.

SEPARATION OF JUDICIAL FROM EXECUTIVE FUNCTIONS IN PAKISTAN

12. *Mr. Nur Ahmed : Will the Honourable Minister for Law and Labour be pleased to state if the Government of Pakistan have taken any steps to appoint a small committee to consider the question of separation of judicial functions from the Executive functions and to make recommendations for simpler, speedier and cheaper agencies for the administration of justice in Pakistan ? If not, why not ?

The Honourable Mr. J. N. Mandal : No. Because it was not considered necessary.

MANUFACTURE AND IMPORT OF FINE YARN AND TEXTILES IN PAKISTAN

13. *Mr. Nur Ahmed : Will the Honourable Minister for Commerce Industries and Works be pleased to make a statement showing :

(a) The total capacity of the Pakistan textile mills to produce yarn and textiles of the finer counts ;

(b) the average quantity of such yarns and textiles that are actually being manufactured at present ;

(c) the quantities of cotton and textiles of such finer counts that have on an average been imported into Pakistan since the 15th August, 1947 ;

(d) the quantities of such fine yarn and textiles exported from Pakistan from the 15th August ; and

(e) the future policy of Government in these matters ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : (a) Yarn of finer counts (40s and above)—5 lakh lbs. per month: finer quality of cloth 27.5 lakh yards per month. This is on the basis of working the spinning machinery three shifts a day and the weaving machinery two shifts a day.

(b) The quantity of such fine yarn produced in January 1948 was 3.33 lakh lbs. and that of cloth woven, 21.45 lakh yards.

(c) The Sea Borne Trade Accounts do not record statistics of imports of cotton textiles according to their counts. On the assumption that information is required in respect of cotton yarn and cloth, the imports from countries other than India during the period 15th August, 1947, to 31st January, 1948, averaged 6.2 lakh yards of cloth per month. There have been no imports of cotton yarn during this period.

(d) There were no exports of yarn. There were no exports from Pakistan after the 15th August, 1947, but goods in transit through Pakistan included 9.6 lakh yards of cloth per month but it is not possible to say how much of it was fine cloth.

(e) The policy of Government is to step up production and secure as large supplies of cotton cloth and yarn from outside as possible so as to meet the requirements of the country.

CONCESSIONS SECURED FOR PAKISTAN RE. EXPORT AND IMPORT TRADES IN
TARIFF AGREEMENT WITH INDIA SIGNED AT GENEVA

14. ***Mr. Nur Ahmed :** Will the Honourable Minister for Commerce, Industries and Works be pleased to state :

(a) Whether the Government of Pakistan are bound by the Tariff Agreement signed at Geneva on the 30th October, 1947, between India and some other nations :

(b) if so, to what extent is Pakistan affected and benefitted by the said Agreement ;

(c) the principles which were kept in view in offering concessions to other countries in matters of rates and preferential margins ;

(d) what concessions have been secured for Pakistan in respect of export and import ;

(e) the main terms of the Final Act adopted at the conclusion of the negotiations at Geneva and also the texts of the general agreement on tariffs and trade and of the protocol of provisional application ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : (a) Pakistan is a signatory of the Final Act adopted at the conclusion of the second session of the Preparatory Committee of the United Nations Conference on Trade and Employment at Geneva on the 30th October, 1947. This amounts to an authentication of texts of a General Agreement on Tariff and Trade and of a Protocol of Provisional application. Signature does not in any way prejudice freedom of action and Pakistan has specifically reserved the right to re-examine the tariff concessions made at Geneva and to re-open negotiations in respect of any such concessions if this is found necessary in the interest of Pakistan's trade and general economy.

(b) and (d) The negotiations leading to the Tariff Agreement were directed to the substantial reduction of tariffs and other charges on imports and exports and the reduction or elimination of preferences on a reciprocal and mutually advantageous basis. A copy of the schedules* of the concessions given by the countries which were a party to the General Agreement is placed on the table.

(c) The principles kept in view in offering concessions to other countries in matter of tariff rates and preferential margins were—

(i) Concessions should be such as are demonstrably in the interest of national economy or as are not injurious to it.

(ii) Concessions should not relate to products which are "protected" or in respect of which a claim to protection is likely to be made during the next three years.

(iii) Concessions should not result in an excessive loss of revenue.

(e) A copy each of the General Agreement* on Tariffs and Trade, the Final Act and the Protocol of Provisional Application are placed on the table.

Mr. Mohammed Ali : Will the Honourable Minister be pleased to state what are the protected products in the Pakistan State ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : All those products which were given protection before partition are treated as protected for the time being.

The Honourable Mr. Hamidul Huq Chowdhury : Is cloth one of the protected products ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : Yes, but there has been a suspension of duties on some commodities so far as protection is concerned.

UNSTARRED QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

ANOMALIES IN SERVICE CONDITIONS OF WORK-CHARGED STAFF IN PAKISTAN PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

1. Alhaji Muhammed Hashim Gazder : Will the Honourable Minister for Commerce, Industries and Works please state :

(a) whether it is a fact that there is a class of workers in the Public Works Department classed as "work-charged".

(b) whether it is a fact that these workers are not made permanent throughout their service even though their service may be continuous for any length of time ;

(c) whether it is a fact that this class of workers is deprived of the usual privileges, such as, leave, pension, allowances, etc., normally enjoyed by other Government servants ;

(d) whether it is a fact that no quarters have been allotted to such employees although they were provided with quarters by the Government of India ;

(e) whether it is a fact that these employees have not been paid the arrears in respect of allowances sanctioned by the Government of India on the acceptance of the Recommendations of the Pay Commission, while

similar arrears have been paid to other classes of Government employees who opted for Pakistan; and

(f) if the replies to the above be in the affirmative, what are the reasons for the differential treatment to this class of workers and whether Government intend taking any action to remove these anomalies?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : (a) Yes.

(b) Yes.

(c) They are entitled to leave and allowances as under :—

Leave per year.—20 days casual leave with pay, 6 days communal leave over and above the closed holidays and Sundays.

Allowances.—Dearness Allowance like other Government servants. They are not entitled to pensions.

(d) Quarters are not provided to these employees and they were not provided by Government of India also.

(e) No. Orders for the payment of the arrears have been issued.

(f) As the work-charged staff has hitherto been employed on purely temporary basis, the concessions mentioned in parts (b), (c) and (d) of the question were not admissible to this staff. The proposal of classifying the staff as permanent, semi-permanent and temporary, and the admissibility of the concessions to them is under consideration.

NUMBER OF CERTAIN OFFICERS OF PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT EMPLOYED IN SIND BEFORE AND AFTER ESTABLISHMENT OF PAKISTAN.

2. Alhajj Muhammed Hashim Gazder : Will the Honourable Minister for Commerce, Industries and Works please state :

(a) the number of (i) officers of the rank of the Electrical Sub-Divisional Officers and above, (ii) the other Officers of the Public Works Department (Civil) employed in Sind after the establishment of Pakistan.

(b) the number of Officers of the same categories employed in Sind before partition; and

(c) the total comparative cost of (a) and (b) ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar :

(a) (i) Electrical Engineers	2
Electrical S. D. Os.	7
(ii) Chief Engineer	1
Superintending Engineers	3
Executive Engineers	6
S. D. Os.	25
(b) Electrical Engineer	1
Electrical S. D. Os.	3
Executive Engineers	2
S. D. Os.	9
(c) (a) Rs. 27,560					
(b) Rs. 8,010					

REQUISITIONED RESIDENTIAL HOUSES IN KARACHI FOR CERTAIN GOVERNMENT OFFICERS

3. **Alhajj Muhammed Hashim Gazder** : Will the Honourable Minister for Commerce, Industries and Works please state in a tabular form :

(a) the names and designations of all Government officers drawing Rs. 500 and over per mensem for whom residential houses have been requisitioned in Karachi ;

(b) the monthly rent payable by the Government for such houses ;

(c) the salary of the officers ; and

(d) the monthly rent charged from the occupant officers ?

The Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar : (a) Houses are not requisitioned for individual officers by name. A statement showing names, designations and salaries of Central Officers drawing Rs. 500 and over per mensem who occupy accommodation requisitioned since 15th August, 1947, is laid on the table. It excludes properties taken over from the Military who requisitioned them under the Defence of India Rules.

(b) Rent for requisitioned houses under the Sind Requisition of Land Act is to be fixed by the Rent Controller, an officer of the Sind Government. The Provincial Government have taken steps to amend the Act so far as it affects the fixation of rent of requisitioned properties and the amended bill is awaiting the assent of H. E. the Governor of Sind. The rents will be fixed in accordance with the provisions of the amended bill soon after it has received the assent. For the present Government are making *ad hoc* quarterly payments to the landlords.

(c) Information has been furnished in the statement mentioned at (a) above.

(d) A Central Government Officer is required to pay 10% of his pay or the standard rent of the house whichever is less. As standard rent has not yet been fixed, rent at the basis of 10% of an officer's pay is being recovered subject to adjustments later on.

Statement showing the names, designations and salary drawn by the Central Government Officers drawing Rs. 500 and over per mensem and for whom Residential Houses have been requisitioned.

Name	Designation	Salary
1. Honourable Mr. Liaquat Ali Khan ..	Premier ..	*Rs. 3,000/-
2. Honourable Mr. I. I. Chundrigar ..	Minister, C. I. & W. ..	*Rs. 3,000/-
3. Honourable Mr. Ghulam Mohammed ..	„ Finance ..	*Rs. 3,000/-
4. Honourable Mr. A. R. Nishtar ..	„ Communications ..	*Rs. 3,000/-
5. Honourable Raja Ghazanfar Ali ..	„ Refugees ..	*Rs. 3,000/-
6. Honourable Mr. J. N. Mandal ..	„ Law and Labour ..	*Rs. 3,000/-
7. Honourable Mr. Fazlur Rahman ..	„ Interior ..	*Rs. 3,000/-
8. Mr. Z. H. Khan ..	Secretary, Communications ..	Rs. 4,000/-
9. K. B. Ubaid Ullah ..	Financial Adviser, Communications ..	Rs. 3,000/-
10. Mr. Ikram Ullah ..	Secretary, Foreign Affairs and Commonwealth Relations ..	Rs. 4,000/-
11. Col. A. S. B. Shah ..	Joint Secretary „ „ ..	Rs. 3,000/-
12. Mr. A. Hilaly ..	Dy. Secretary „ „ ..	Rs. 1,750/-
13. Mr. Mohd. Azam Khan ..	Supdtg. Engineer, P.P.W.D. ..	Rs. 1,850/-

*The salaries of Ministers are exclusive of rent of their houses which is borne by Government.

Name	Designation	Salary
14. Mr. H. P. Goodwyn	Deputy Secy. Cabinet Sectt.	Rs. 1,750
15. Mr. A. A. Burney	Deputy Secy., C.B.R.	Rs. 1,750
16. Mr. M. H. Mumford	Finance	Rs. 1,400
17. Dr. M. A. Latif	Education	Rs. 1,350
18. Mr. M. N. Mirza	Dy. Director-General, P. & T.	Rs. 1,950
19. Mr. A. A. Said	Dy. Secy., Commerce	Rs. 1,330
20. Mian Naseem Husain	Dy. Secy., Foreign Affairs and Commonwealth Relations	Rs. 1,300
21. Mr. Q. U. Shahab	Under Secretary, C. I. & W.	Rs. 1,200
22. Dr. Ali Ahmed	Director, Development	Rs. 1,250
23. Mr. S. M. Nazir	Director, Supply and Development	Rs. 1,250
24. Lt. Comr. A. Rashid	Royal Pakistan Navy	Rs. 1,218
25. Mr. A. Salam	A. F. A., Mily. Finance	Rs. 1,200
26. Mr. Azizul Haq	Asstt. Secy., C. I. & W.	Rs. 1,150
27. Mr. M. A. Zafar	Dy. Director, Information Bureau	Rs. 1,050
28. Mr. Mohd. Aslam Khan	Controller of Inspection	Rs. 1,050
29. Mr. M. Chohan	Dy. Director, Rly. Deptt.	Rs. 1,000
30. Mr. K. F. Khalil	Dy. Chief Controller of Export and Import	Rs. 875
31. Mr. A. M. Khan	Ditto	Rs. 975
32. Dr. S. M. Siddiqui	Information Officer	Rs. 850
33. Mr. Ahmed Salam	Dy. Controller of Broadcasting	Rs. 850
34. Mr. N. N. Dallas	Dy. Director, S. & D.	Rs. 820
35. Mr. M. Y. Kureshi	Under Secy., Food	Rs. 825
36. Mr. A. R. Qureshi	Asstt. Secy., Communications	Rs. 800

PAKISTAN GENERAL SALES TAX BILL

The Honourable Mr. Ghulam Mohammed (Minister for Finance): Sir, I wish to move that leave to introduce a Bill to provide for the levy of a general tax on the sale of goods in the Provinces of Pakistan be granted.

Mr. Deputy President : The question is :

"That leave be granted to introduce a Bill to provide for the levy of a general tax on the sale of goods in the Provinces of Pakistan."

The motion was adopted.

The Honourable Mr. Ghulam Mohammed : Sir, I introduce the Bill.

GENERAL BUDGET—LIST OF DEMANDS

SECOND STAGE

Mr. Deputy President : Now we take the Demands.

DEMAND NO. 7.—IRRIGATION (INCLUDING WORKING EXPENSES) NAVIGATION, EMBANKMENT AND DRAINAGE WORKS MET FROM REVENUE

The Honourable Mr. Ghulam Mohammed (Minister of Finance): Sir, I move :

"That sums not exceeding Rs. 7,70,000 and Rs. 5,22,000 be granted to the Governor-General to defray the charges which will come in course of payment respectively during the years ending on the 31st day of March, 1948 and 31st day of March, 1949 in respect of 'Irrigation (including working expenses), Navigation, Embankment and Drainage Works met from revenue'."

Mr. Deputy President : Motion moved :

"That sums not exceeding Rs. 7,70,000 and Rs. 5,22,000 be granted to the Governor-General to defray the charges which will come in course of payment respectively during the years ending on the 31st day of March, 1948 and 31st day of March, 1949 in respect of 'Irrigation (including working expenses), Navigation, Embankment and Drainage Works met from revenue'."

Immediate necessity of expanding the Harbour of Chittagong

Prof. Raj Kumar Chakraverty (East Bengal : General) : Sir, I beg leave to move :

“ That the Demand under the Head ‘ Irrigation, Navigation, Embankment and Drainage Works—Interest on Works ’ for which capital Accounts are kept be reduced by Re. 1.”

In doing so, Sir, I have no desire to criticise the administration in any way, but I only want to know the views of the Government on the future of the Harbour of Chittagong and what steps the Government have already taken to expand and improve the Harbour and what time they will possibly require to complete the steps they propose to take. I need hardly emphasise the necessity of immediate improvement and expansion of the Harbour of Chittagong. I shall only say that what Karachi is to Western Pakistan, Chittagong is to Eastern Pakistan. It is the only important centre for all our exports and imports and for all our supplies, and also from the stand-point of our defence and safety, it is very, very important. Sir, let us take good care of Karachi, but let us take better care of Chittagong, for Karachi is already developed, but Chittagong is not.

Mr. Deputy President : Cut motion moved :

“ That the Demand under the Head ‘ Irrigation, Navigation, Embankment and Drainage Works—Interest on Works’, for which capital Accounts are kept be reduced by Re. 1.”

The Honourable Mr. Hamidul Huq Chowdhury (East Bengal : Muslim) : I want, Sir, to bring to the notice of the Honourable House, the Honourable Members and the Honourable Minister in charge that it is essential that we must have a second inland port, if possible, besides Chittagong. The development of Chittagong will certainly take time and unless we start quickly on a large scale, it cannot be brought into effective use and its services enlarged as quickly as it is necessary. Sir, with the introduction of barriers between India and Pakistan, there has been practically a complete stoppage of all movement of commodities between Calcutta and East Bengal. The House is aware that Calcutta was the entry port for the entire East Bengal, including parts of northern India. East Bengal entirely depends for all its imported commodities upon this port. Suddenly, on the 1st of March, 1948, the Government of India has brought about a complete cessation of movement of all commodities between East Bengal and West Bengal. East Bengal depends for everything which she needs in the shape of imported articles which must pass through Calcutta. Facilities in Chittagong are extremely restricted and the services which bring in commodities from abroad are still unorganised and it is not possible for some time for us to get our essential necessities through Chittagong. Therefore, Sir, the Government of Pakistan and the Government of India we hope will come to an understanding immediately for the purpose of keeping the movement of trade and commerce continuous during this period, at least for a period during which we cannot develop Chittagong.

Sir, it is possible for us to retaliate by denying to Calcutta what she wants from East Bengal. But that way the solution of the problem will not lie. We can completely dry up some of the essential industries of Calcutta, but, I submit, Sir, we are not going to accept it as a policy because that will lead us nowhere. We hope that the Government of India will show reason and commonsense. It is a fact that greater amount of pressure they put upon us and deny us the present facilities the more will be our incentive to build up Chittagong ; from that point of view greater responsibility is placed upon the

[The Hon'ble Mr. Hamidul Haq Chowdhury.]

Central Government to build up Chittagong quickly. The export from Chittagong port for some time to come will be limited because there is no riverian approach to that port. Therefore the single line has to be doubled, still it will not be able to cope with all the traffic that will have to pass in the near future. Looking to this disadvantage of the Chittagong port, I think we must provide for an alternative port. It was suggested, and I think it is possible, that Moradganj lying within the district of Khulna will provide a suitable alternative port which may rival Calcutta, if not surpass in utility and advantages. We have been pressing upon the Central Government to send experts to make a survey. This place is on the river about 30 miles from the sea which is much shorter in distance compared to Calcutta from the mouth of the sea. The river itself is much deeper than the river Hoogly. The only thing is to find out whether the estuarian approach is deep enough for the ships to approach and enter the river from the sea. Further the survey should be taken and completed by experts recognised by Lloyds otherwise foreign ships will not come for in that case Lloyds cannot issue insurance. Therefore I submit and earnestly press upon the Central Government that they should take up the work or organise immediately before the season is over and we can start the work of survey when the season comes in, otherwise there will be a delay of another year. For this small work the Central Government of Pakistan will not have to spend more than 10 lakhs of rupees. They will have to spend some money over purchase of survey fittings and instruments, and engage technical persons for survey purposes. Therefore I press upon the Central Government of Pakistan to see that this essential work is started immediately even if they have not provided for it in the Budget.

Mr. Nur Ahmed (East Bengal : Muslim) : Sir, I wish to make a few remarks regarding the development of Chittagong port.

Chittagong port has got an ancient history of its own. Its earliest records mention trade with China and other far-east countries. The strong Portuguese element in section of population derives from 16th century when they knew it "Porto Grande". Modern development dates from 1889 when the first jetty was built and these numbers have been increased to four in 1907. Subsequent development has taken the form of training the fickle Karnafulli river, which owing to heavy seasonal flow of water from Chittagong Hills changes its course at the mouth. From time to time, over a crore has been spent on revetment of river banks, training wall and dredgers. The river is so successfully trained now that it scores its own bed, renders dredging relatively unnecessary. The jetty-accommodation, frontage of feed there is 1,485 ft. and that of fourth jetty is 600 ft., in all 2,085 ft. and 500 ft. long vessel can go to jetty all times. It has a canal portion which is smaller as compared with the canal portion of Calcutta, Vizagapattam and other ports of India. It has no shoals like that of Hooghli river. Chittagong port has been neglected very much. Here is a port which can be made a first class deep sea port according to Mr. Buchanan who enquired into the potentialities of this port in 1920 at a cost of about 90 lakhs of rupees. Unfortunately the Government of India did not pay any attention to this port and I find that the Sub-Committee which was appointed very recently in 1946 by the Government of India in their report even do not mention the name of Chittagong port and this port was put in cold storage. Now it is the great opportunity for Pakistan Government to develop this

port not in the interest of the Eastern Pakistan alone but in the interest of the Government of the Central Pakistan. Enormous revenues in the shape of customs, etc., will flow from this port. I know there is a scheme to develop ports and it is divided into two parts. The second part deals with construction of jetties and wharves. This scheme will be completed in 1948-49. Another project which was under contemplation of the Government of Pakistan was to add some other Jetty at Salt Golas. But the present condition is not very good or favourable. There is not sufficient storage godowns for bales of jute coming from the East Bengal or Assam. There is no accommodation for storage at Jetty and goods coming from Naraingunj could not be accommodated and stocked. Sir, it is one of the most important things which should be looked into.

I earnestly appeal to the Honourable Minister in charge to look into this matter carefully and set up a Finance Corporation or some such thing. Money will not be wanting for development of Chittagong port and it will be generously contributed by all the people of Pakistan and the people of Chittagong and I shall be happy to make their humble contributions to this Corporation to the fullest extent and with that money we can develop this port. I think, Sir, I am not suggesting the Pakistan Government any extra burden, but it will be a source of additional income resultant on the development of this port.

Alhaji Muhammad Hashim Gazder (Sind: Muslim): Sir, the Honourable gentleman who preceded me made reference to the Ports Committee that was appointed by the Government of India, I wish to say that I was myself a member of that Committee and the terms of reference were very limited and that is the reason why we could not report for the development of the Chittagong Port. The terms of reference were to find out deep sea ports on the Eastern Coast of India, because Madras was not a safe port during the war and also to find out whether any other port could be developed between Bombay and Karachi. So, Sir, that is why that reference makes no reference to Chittagong port, but, Sir, our present position is such that it should be the duty of our Government to develop the port of Chittagong immediately. All means of communications now with the Eastern Pakistan depend on the port of Chittagong and if it is not developed we will never be able to export our raw goods from Pakistan and get our requirements of dollar currency. I myself do not know, Sir, why no attention has been paid to the dire necessity of improving this port which is one of the finest ports that we have got in Pakistan today. Sir, it will not be also expensive for the Government to develop it and I will strongly urge that the Pakistan Government should take up this question immediately. Sir, I do not also understand why this demand for Chittagong port has been raised under this Grant. It should have come under the head "Ports and Pilotage" and I hope the Honourable Minister in charge will start investigation for the improvement of this port as early as possible and commence works as soon as convenient.

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar (Minister for Communications): Sir, as pointed out by my Honourable friend Mr. Gazder, this demand has been moved under the head which has nothing to do with the Communication Ministry although port of Chittagong is within their administrative jurisdiction. Anyhow, in view of the rulings that you have given yesterday, I think it is immaterial to say that this question should not have

[The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar]

It is after all for the good of all. I may in the outset been taken at this stage. It is after all for the good of all. I may in the outset point out that Pakistan Government give great importance to the development of the port of Chittagong and not only to importance of development, but to developing it at the earliest possible opportunity. Right from the date of establishment of this Government, the question was taken up by my officials and they were sent to the spot to discuss the matter on the spot with Port Commissioners. I myself went over there in the month of January and had long discussions with the Port Commissioner as well as with the officers of E.B. Railway and other Port Authorities. There is some administrative difficulty also in connection with the Port of Chittagong. So far as the dredging, pilot services and other duties under the Port Act are concerned, they are performed by the Port Commissioner and so far as the harbour works, wharfs, godowns, sheds, and other things are concerned, all these functions are assigned to Railway Department. This is creating some difficulties in our way and I had had long discussion with the Port Authorities and also with the authorities of E.B. Railway. I pointed out to them that we should solve this question so that it may not create any difficulty in the development of the Chittagong port. At present, on the one hand so far as East Bengal Railway authorities are concerned, they are ready with their programme but we are not content with their programme and are contacting experts from foreign countries also. It is under consideration of the Government whether it will be desirable or not to have the advice of the foreign experts also before proceeding with the programme. The programme as chalked out by the railway authorities has been divided into three phases and if all this is completed, then it is expected that Chittagong port will be able to deal with about three times the tonnage that it can deal at present. As some Honourable Members are aware, the present capacity of the Chittagong port is about a million tons of exports and imports. Of course, during the pre-war period its capacity was never utilised in full for various reasons that are known to everybody because Chittagong port was treated in a particular manner. The maximum reached during the pre-war period was about, I think, six hundred thousand tons. During the war, one year actually the imports and exports reached to 12,50,000 tons. Therefore if the programme that the railway authorities have chalked out is completed and I hope it will be completed within a short period, then I am sure we shall be able on a normal basis, to deal with 2½ million tons and it is just possible that in case of necessity, with more also. Honourable Members will find, Sir, that an item of Rs. 40 lakhs has been provided for it in the present Budget. My Honourable friend, Mr. Nur Ahmed, suggested the establishment of a financial corporation. I may assure him that the improvement of Chittagong port is so important that Government will not spare any amount for its development. We will not need the establishment of a financial corporation for that purpose. The development of the port of Chittagong, as pointed out by Honourable Members, is one of the most important questions and that is the view of the Pakistan Government also, therefore, any money that will be needed for its development, will be forthcoming. I have no doubt about it.

Honourable Mr. Hamidul Haq Chowdhury referred to the establishment of alternative port also. In that connection he said that Moradganj could be developed. I had had discussion about this question also with some of the Bengal Ministers and also with some experts. There are possibilities of developing Moradganj as port. It will not be in the interest of Pakistan, if I disclose at this stage some of the questions that are involved in the develop-

ment of Moradganj port, but I will inform the members of this Honourable House that even during this busy period of the Assembly, I and my office had to find time to spend some hours over the discussion of this question because we considered it an important one and it is being examined. No time will be lost and I assure the Honourable Members that consistently with the interest of Chittagong port, the development of Moradganj will be duly considered. Sir, the whole picture has to be taken into consideration in the light of our present difficulties and future problems. In view of the assurance, that I have given, Sir, I am sure, Mr. Chakraverty will be prepared to withdraw his cut motion.

Prof. Raj Kumar Chakraverty : In view of the assurance given by the Honourable Minister in charge, I withdraw my cut motion.

The Honourable Mr. Ghulam Mohammed : Sir, I rise to refer to what Honourable Mr. Hamidul Haq Chowdhury has said about Trade Relationship of India and Pakistan. He has referred to the position of supplies from the port of Calcutta prior to the existence of Pakistan. He has also expressed the view that retaliation by stoppage of supplies from East Bengal to West Bengal would not be the proper measure to counteract any tendency on the part of the sister Dominion in that direction. I am sure Members of the House and people outside are very much concerned about the future trade relations between India and Pakistan. This is not the occasion for the Government to make any statement of policy, but to allay any misgivings that might have arisen in the minds of the people, I want to state again that our Government has been continuously trying from the very beginning—from about September last—up to date to come to some reasonable understanding with India in the matter of trade relations. The economy of both the Dominions is in many ways interwoven and interdependent and to upset it by the establishment of indiscriminate custom barriers is likely to injure the economies of both the Dominions. It may be that we may be able to do more harm and the other Dominion will do less harm. But it is not our intention either to cause that injury or to receive that injury. Therefore, it depends on the attitude adopted by the Indian Dominion and I hope—and I trust this House will be with me in that hope—that it will soon be possible to arrive at an amicable settlement between the two Dominions on that issue. We shall do all we can to enter into a reasonable settlement. The only qualification that I mentioned earlier in my Budget speech and to which I also referred in my reply to Budget discussion is that we must try to foster our industries and we must ourselves try to protect our industries. We cannot continue to remain only the producers of raw materials and suppliers of raw materials. We cannot go on with only growing cotton and selling it to the cotton mills of Bombay. We must have our own cotton mills and jute mills. Subject to that condition and if that is agreed to, we shall be prepared to enter into any reasonable arrangements which are to the mutual advantage of the two Dominions. I want to dispel any fear that Mr. Hamidul Haq may have that it is the intention of our Government to start or continue any trade war or customs war with India. We want to live in amity with India and we shall do everything we can to promote that amity.

The cut motion was, by leave of the Assembly, withdrawn.

Mr. Deputy President : The question is :

“ That sums not exceeding Rs. 7,70,000 and Rs. 5,22,000 be granted to the Governor-General to defray the charges which will come in course of payment respectively during the years ending on the 31st day of March, 1948, and 31st day of March, 1949, in respect of ‘ Irrigation (including working expenses), Navigation, Embankment and Drainage Works met from revenue’.”

The motion was adopted.

DEMAND NO. 8—PAKISTAN POSTS AND TELEGRAPHS DEPARTMENT

The Honourable Mr. Ghulam Mohammed ; Sir, I move :

“ That sums not exceeding Rs. 2,36,12,000 and Rs. 4,40,20,000 be granted to the Governor-General to defray the charges which will come in course of payment respectively during the years ending on the 31st day of March, 1948 and 31st day of March, 1949, in respect of Pakistan Posts and Telegraphs Department’.”

Mr. Deputy President : Motion moved :

“ That sums not exceeding Rs. 2,36,12,000 and Rs. 4,40,20,000 be granted to the Governor-General to defray the charges which will come in course of payment respectively during the years ending on the 31st day of March, 1948 and 31st day of March, 1949, in respect of Pakistan Posts and Telegraphs Department’.”

Mismanagement and Irregularities in the working of the Postal System in Eastern Pakistan

Prof. Raj Kumar Chakraverty : Sir, I move :

“ That the demand under the head ‘ Pakistan Posts and Telegraphs Department ’ be reduced by Re. 1.”

Impropriety of increasing the price of inland post cards

Prof. Raj Kumar Chakraverty : Sir, I move :

“ That the demand under the head ‘ Pakistan Posts and Telegraphs Department ’ be reduced by Re. 1.”

Raising a discussion about the (a) working of the Postal and Telegraphs Department, (b) posting of non-Bengalee employees including peons in the urban and rural areas of East Bengal, (c) increase in rate for inland post cards from half an anna to nine pies.

Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta : Sir, I move :

“ That the demand under the head ‘ Pakistan Posts and Telegraphs Department ’ be reduced by Rs. 100.”

The Honourable Mr. Ghazanfar Ali Khan (Minister for Refugees, Relief and Rehabilitation) : May I submit, Sir, that your ruling of yesterday applies to this Demand also and we should not discuss these amendments now? These points can be discussed on the Finance Bill.

The Honourable Mr. Ghulam Mohammed : Sir, my friend, Mr. Ghazanfar Ali Khan, wishes to remind you of the ruling you gave yesterday that a cut motion should not anticipate a discussion on the Finance Bill. You gave a ruling yesterday. That is why my friend, Mr. Ghazanfar Ali Khan, has referred to your two rulings of yesterday. You gave two rulings yesterday ; one was about anticipating a discussion on the Finance Bill and the second was about having more than one item under each cut. On the second issue, you held for this particular session that as Members had not previous intimation you will allow them to discuss more than one item under one cut motion only this year. But the ruling on the first issue was that all such cut motions were out of order. The matter raised in these cut motions will come before the House when the Finance Bill is discussed. Therefore, I submit, that according to your ruling they are out of order.

Mr. Deputy President : Which cut motion are you referring to ?

The Honourable Mr. Ghulam Mohammed : Cut motion No. 23, which seeks to discuss the impropriety of increasing the price of inland post cards.

Mr. Deputy President : For future guidance of the Members I would like to point out that if any Honourable Member wishes to take any objection to a motion being moved, he should avail himself of the earliest opportunity.

The Honourable Mr. Liaquat Ali Khan (Leader of the House): Sir, a point of order can only be raised once the House is in possession of a motion. The Honourable the Finance Minister could not take an objection until the motion was moved before the House. He has, therefore, taken the earliest opportunity of raising the point of order and bringing it to the attention of the Chair. As a matter of fact, you have not even yet put these motion to the House. Only the Members have moved their motions and my Honourable colleague has taken the earliest opportunity of raising the point of order. I do not think he could have taken an earlier opportunity than what he has done.

Mr. Deputy President : That view may be accepted. But when a Member is about to move a motion, which another Member thinks is out of order, he should stand up at that stage and take objection to it. That will not only not be improper but will facilitate business more than if objection is taken later on. However, for the time being, I accept the view of the Honourable the Leader of the House. It appears, therefore, that according to the ruling that I gave yesterday, cut motion No. 23, (*i.e.*, Prof. Chakraverty's 2nd motion and part (c) of Mr. Datta's motion) are out of order, but, as already stated, Members will be entitled to speak generally on the demand.

The Leader of the House has pointed out another thing. The rule is that as soon as a motion is moved by an Honourable Member
 II A.M. the Chair has to put it to the House. In this case I did not do so and I did not do so purposely. So far as these cut motions are concerned they are all more or less of the same nature and I thought that strict adherence to the wording of the rule concerned might not be necessary.

The Honourable Mr. Liaquat Ali Khan : I have no objection to that but I was only trying to make my point that the earliest opportunity was taken to raise the point of order.

Mr. Deputy President : Now, Prof. Chakraverty's first cut motion and parts (a) and (b) of Mr. Datta's motion are open for discussion and may be taken up.

Mr. Abdulla-al Mahmood (East Bengal: Muslim) : I think a motion can be taken up as a whole. It can be passed as a whole or it can be rejected as a whole. If it is out of order the whole of it is out of order; if not, the whole of it is in order.

Mr. Deputy President : I do not accept that view. The cut motions and the demand are open to discussion.

Prof. Raj Kumar Chakraverty : Sir, in moving this cut motion I regret to have to say that it seems East Bengal has fallen on evil days. Many members yesterday expressed the view that the Railway system in East Bengal has become absolutely inefficient but I have to point out today that the postal system also there has become totally inefficient and its working there has become very, very irregular. I gave some of the reasons in my speech on the

[Prof. Raj Kumar Chakraverty]

General Debate that was held the other day. The Postal Department had got very good reputation for efficiency. Since the last three months or so there has been a complete breakdown, if not a deadlock, in the working of the Postal system in Eastern Pakistan ; so much so that one could not purchase stamps, post cards, etc., in Post Offices. One could not get even the Money Order Forms or any other forms necessary for doing any other work connected with the Post Office. It is necessary for me to mention that letters were posted but they did not reach the addressees.

Sir, one of the reasons for these irregularities and inefficiency has been said by the Government to be that a number of gentlemen from other Provinces have been posted there who do not know the language of the Province and therefore could not do any work in connection with sorting, etc. Sir, we appreciate the difficulties of Government in this matter. Certainly, these people could not be asked to get out but we hope that the Government will also consider the difficulties—the immense difficulties—of the public, which they have been experiencing for the last three or four months. I have to admit that there has been some improvement in the system very recently but that is not all that is desirable. Even today a Money Order takes 15 or 20 days in reaching the addressee from one part of East Bengal to another.

With regard to telegrams it is better to send a letter rather than a telegram. The Postal Department is known to be a public utility Department but utility of the public is not now what is to be found in the working of the Postal Services in East Bengal. In that way, Sir, the revenue of the Government is being very much affected. It is really strange why post cards or even Money Order Forms should not be available. I can understand other difficulties due to the posting of a number of people who do not know the language of the Province but certainly the Government cannot say that they have not enough machinery at their disposal to print forms, post cards, etc. Therefore, Sir, even from the revenue stand-point there should be a tightening up of the Administration in the Postal Department as early as possible. That will not only help the Government in the matter of their revenue but that will also bring back the confidence of the public in the Postal system of Eastern Pakistan which they have already lost. The result is heavy withdrawal of money from the Savings Bank. There are no transactions with regard to the National Savings Certificates, etc. I therefore beg to draw the attention of the Government just to tighten up the Administration a bit more strongly.

Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta : I completely endorse what has been said by Prof. Chakraverty. The grievances are many and they are well-known to Government and we hope and trust that those grievances will be removed in the near future—in the course of a week or fortnight—otherwise the revenues of Government, which suffer at present will continue to suffer, apart from the question of a redress of the grievances of the public.

Alhaji Muhammad Hashim Gazder (Sind : Muslim) : Sir, I rise to oppose the cut motion. I would draw the attention of the Minister to the rotten state of the Postal and Telegraphs Department. Sir, it has become a very sad and painful affair that postal deliveries are not regular. Several complaints have been made. I myself have got experience that letters posted in Karachi do not reach the addressees for seven or ten days and sometimes not at all. I myself posted, Sir, 34 letters one night with my own hand and, Sir, as many as 12 never reached their destinations.

Several Honourable Members : When did it happen? In the pre-partition days?

Alhaji Muhammed Hashim Gazder : As far as I remember it was the month of August—not pre-partition but after partition. Some friends have written to me to raise this debate here. They have given me examples for the month of February when letters were not delivered.

Then, Sir, something about telegrams. It is no use sending any telegrams. We try to get into contact with some persons on telephone but the experience is not very good. Whenever I telephone and ask the telephone operator "please connect me to so and so on trunk line", the reply mostly is that the other side is not working. Who is responsible for this? This is gross inefficiency. There are instances when the bell of complaint number continues to ring for five or ten minutes and nobody attends to it. I do not know what is happening. (*Mr. Nazir Ahmad Khan :* "There are worse examples"). We do not want to follow worse examples. We want efficiency in Posts and Telegraphs Department. (*An Honourable Member :* "Irrespective of circumstances.") We want to restore the position of efficiency. Then, Sir, we have never heard in Posts and Telegraphs Department of clerks taking money before money order can be booked or a registered letter can be booked. At least I never heard of that, Sir. Now this has become very common all over Sind. Anybody who wants to get a registered letter or a telegram to be sent he must give money to the postal clerk.

The Honourable Mr. Ghazanfar Ali Khan : Are they Sindhis or outsiders?

Alhaji Muhammed Hashim Gazder : All outsiders and mostly Punjabis, Sir.

The Honourable Mr. Ghazanfar Ali Khan : That is the reason.

Alhaji Muhammed Hashim Gazder : Sir, I request Raja Ghazanfar Ali Khan not to interrupt me. Then, Sir, so much superfluous and redundant appointments are being made that at least the common man in the street cannot understand. Sir, the staff is increased while there is no increase of work. Even when the work has decreased below 30 or 50 per cent, the staff is being increased. The volume of traffic has so much decreased and where is the question of, Sir, then increasing the staff. Sir, I want to read a note and I may have to refer to certain things because nepotism is being practised.

The Honourable Mr. Ghulam Mohammed : Is traffic going up?

Alhaji Muhammed Hashim Gazder : That is for the Honourable Minister concerned to tell. I have my figures. I have made enquiries. In some cases it is 50 per cent. less and in some cases it is less than 30 per cent. Sukkur telegraph office used to earn Rs. 3,000 a day but now its outturn is only 3,000 for six months. Similar is the case with Karachi. Then why increase the staff. Sir, the revenues of telegraph offices at Karachi, Hyderabad, Sukkur and Quetta have considerably decreased but in order to raise the status of the Superintendent of C.T.O., Karachi, into that of Chief Superintendent and to provide their own favourites the number of staff in the Karachi C.T.O. has been increased by cent. per cent. The present staff: Selection Grade 5, proposed 10. Higher selection grade there was nil, 2 are proposed now. Number of clerks increased by 80. The increase in the staff has been made

[Alhaji Muhammad Hashim Gazder.]

Without consulting the head of the circle. The appointments sanctioned for Post-War Development before partition still continue in Gazetted and non-Gazetted rank when there is no work in connection with the Post-War Development in Pakistan. Retention of these posts is superfluous and unnecessary burden on Government.

The number of Gazetted and non-Gazetted staff is extremely high in proportion to that of India, considering that there are only two Major and one Minor Circle in Pakistan.

Officers in the P. and T. Department are paid allowances on lavish scale as when a Deputy Postmaster-General works as Director, Posts and Telegraphs, which post is in identical scale of pay, he gets a special pay of Rs. 250 p.m. Similarly Superintendents of Post Offices whose initial pay is Rs. 240 p.m. when they work as Assistant Deputy Director-General get a special pay of Rs. 250 p.m., i.e., more than their initial pay and Rs. 100 p.m. when they work as Assistant Postmaster-General. In addition to that, Sir, they get house rent. A person who gets Rs. 400 as salary is entitled to pay only Rs. 40 as rent. But he occupies a bungalow worth Rs. 100 or Rs. 200 a month and the balance is paid by Pakistan Government, Sir.

Then, Sir, favouritism and nepotism and corruption has increased and resulted in inefficiency in the Department and consequent loss of revenue to the State. The following are few instances :—

1. Mohd. Ismail Ansari, unqualified candidate is working as Head Clerk to Superintendent of Post Offices, Quetta, when qualified local candidates are available.

2. Promotion of Messrs. A. H. Khan.....

Dr. Mahmud Husain (East Bengal: Muslim): Sir, on a point of order, Mr. Gazder told us that he was speaking against the cut motion. Is he still sticking to that view?

Mr. Deputy President: He is speaking generally on the demand.

Alhaji Muhammad Hashim Gazder: Now, Sir (*The Honourable Mr. Ghazanfar Ali Khan*: "Is he speaking or reading?") I am reading, Sir, (*An Honourable Member*: "He wanted excuse for mentioning certain names"). I do not know even the gentlemen mentioned. Unless the names are mentioned how nepotism can be described and become intelligible to the Minister in charge.

Then, Sir, promotions of Messrs. A. H. Khan, A. Latif Shah and Abdul Qadir to the Lower Selection Grade in the Karachi Foreign Post over their seniors who are fit and eligible for such promotions.

Appointment of an official.....

The Honourable Mr. Ghazanfar Ali Khan: On a point of order, Sir, I must draw your attention to the fact, is it permissible for any Honourable Member of this House to mention particularly names of officers whose promotion is being challenged? As far as I remember this is not a parliamentary procedure so far in any House because it is unfair to those officers whose names are mentioned. They are not here to defend themselves. So I want your ruling.

Alhaji Muhammed Hashim Gazder: The Honourable Raja Saheb has not heard me. It is far from me to mention any names. But, Sir, without mentioning.....

Mr. Deputy President : Have you got to say anything against the point that has been taken ?

Alhaji Muhammad Hashim Gazder : It is not a point of order at all, Sir.

Mr. Deputy President : I think that is the general policy accepted by all Houses. The reason given by the Honourable Member is a very cogent one that it is improper to refer to persons who are not here and who cannot, if they are attacked, defend themselves. That is a very salutary precedent.

The Honourable Mr. Ghazanfar Ali Khan : I further submit, Sir, that in view of this ruling these names should be deleted from the proceedings.

Alhaji Muhammad Hashim Gazder : Then, Sir, appointment of an official as S. P. M., Karachi City, in the grade 250/350 by diverting him from West Punjab where he was originally posted on partition has resulted in supersession of local officials.

Then, Sir, Assistant Superintendent, R. M. S., Karachi, originally posted to Dacca, has been diverted to Sind and Baluchistan Circle resulting in posting of the junior-most officials in West Punjab and Dacca in Higher Selection Grade marring the efficiency of the Department.

Then, Sir, I.P.O., Bijnor, who was first posted to West Punjab, was diverted to Sind and Baluchistan Circle where he being the senior-most I. P. O. will get promotion to Higher Selection Grade at the cost of the local officials and also marring the chances of qualified candidates of 1947 examination when the number of posts are already limited in Sind and Baluchistan Circle.

Now, Sir, this is concerned with transfer. Is it not unfair to transfer a senior officer from Dacca to Sind in order that his juniors might get promotion at Dacca and seniors here should be kept back ? I do not know who is responsible, whose power it is to do all that, but, Sir, I wanted to bring this to the notice of the Minister, because the ultimate responsibility lies on the Central Government.

Mr. Nur Ahmed (East Bengal : Muslim) : Sir, with your permission, I wish to make a few observations on the Demands for Grants. The Posts and Telegraphs Department has come in for a good deal of criticism for mismanagement and irregularities in the working of the postal system in Eastern Pakistan. I quite realise their difficulties. After partition, there was dislocation both in the postal and telegraphic traffic on account of the transfer of employees and officers who opted for one or the other Dominion. Those employees who opted for Pakistan could not be transported due to disturbances in the Punjab and elsewhere. These difficulties and dislocations were there, but still there is a good deal of improvement in the working of the Department since, for which our Honourable Minister deserves congratulations. Sir, we still find in some cases there has been inordinate delay, as for example, one airmail letter sent to me from the Secretary of the Muslim League on the 18th November reached me on the 6th January this year. I sent the letter and the cover to the Secretary for his information. Sometimes express telegrams sent by me reached Karachi three or four days later. Sir, I hope the Honourable Minister in charge will look into this state of affairs. Sir, I wish that the people of Pakistan would co-operate with the Administration to make the Posts and Telegraphs Department most efficient and better than that what it was under the Britishers. Sir, with your permission, I do not like to take very much time of the House.

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar (Minister for Communications): Sir, I am extremely thankful to the Honourable Members who, while discussing these cut motions, frankly admitted that there were difficulties in the way of the Administration. I am also a little bit gratified to hear from both sides, from the Opposition and from the other side, an admission to this effect, though in various degrees that there has been an improvement in the administration of this Department. The Opposition, quite naturally, qualified it with the word "some". Others said good improvement. Anyhow, I am satisfied with the word whether it is 'some' or 'good'. Sir, so far as the administration of Posts and Telegraphs is concerned, like so many other Departments, it suffered heavily on account of the war. Trained people had to be sent to various theatres of war and on account of that, untrained people had to be recruited. Over and above that, during the war the traffic increased immensely and, therefore, more recruitment had to be made and all educational standards and every other restriction was given up with a view to get somebody to do the work. These difficulties were present even before partition and the efficiency of the Department really suffered. I remember, Sir, it was pointed out to me once by the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs of United India that he went to a particular place, which is the capital of a Province and a letter addressed to him was found in Dead Letter Office with a note that the addressee is not known. This was the state of affairs during the war in the Posts and Telegraphs Department and it was at such a juncture that we inherited this Department. Now, when partition was effected, some other difficulties stepped in. Firstly, disturbances took place in the Western Pakistan. So far as Eastern Pakistan is concerned, the Centre was Calcutta, therefore, the Central Office remained there. A new Office and a new Centre had to be set up at Dacca. So far as the staff is concerned, untrained staff had to be divided. Option was given to the people. Our representatives suggested that in some categories at least no division should take place and no option should be given, but the other side would not agree, with the result that those who wanted to opt for India had to go away and those who opted from all over India for Pakistan had to be brought here. This resulted in maladjustment between various categories of service. In some categories we were surplus, while in others we were deficit; so the whole thing had to be re-arranged and some time a round peg had to be put into a square hole and a new arrangement and a new adjustment had to be taken in hand.

Unfortunately, the people who had opted for India, as in the case of Railways, gave up taking any interest in their work and there were desertions also in some cases. You will be surprised to know that only in Dacca there were half a million of money orders to be disposed of when partition took place. You can judge the state of affairs from that. With this huge arrears that was left behind, these untrained hands, quite new to the locality did their best and in some cases, as I pointed out, it was done under very great mental suffering because those who had come from India had left their relations and dear ones exposed to risk and actually some fell victim to aggression at the hands of unsocial elements in India with the result that with such disturbed minds it was difficult for them to efficiently deal with difficult problems and such a great dislocation. All these difficulties confronted us when the partition took place. I submit, Sir, that these factors naturally did create very great dislocation and it took a long time for a letter to reach its destination. I hope Honourable Members realise that it was quite natural in the circumstances in which we were then placed.

One of the Honourable Ministers of India who met me once at Lahore hold me that a letter addressed to him from Madras to Delhi and which was posted on 1st of August, that is before the partition, reached Delhi on 30th of September. This was an area which comparatively speaking was free from the effects of partition. From Delhi to Madras such a state of things existed. This being the state of things, it is not surprising to find as the Honourable Members have pointed out that there was great dislocation and great delays in the delivery of letters and telegrams. I have myself been receiving letters and telegrams considerably late. I am glad that Honourable Member, Mr. Gazder, admits that there is an improvement in the state of things at present and this improvement has occurred within a short period of six months. I hope looking to the maladjustment and the untrained staff. Honourable Members will appreciate that all is not so bad in the State of Denmark as Mr. Gazder sees it.

On question of Stores, I might tell you that stores worth 110 lakhs are due to us and up to this time we have received stores of the value of over a lakh only. That is all. In East Bengal there was defective and worn out materials. There was very little telegraphic and telephonic facility. So far as posts and telegraphs is concerned, we were confronted with this huge arrears and the question was whether to clear all the arrears first or to improve the current postal arrangements first. It was decided that the best thing would be to attend to the current posts first and along with it gradually to clear off the arrears also. You will find that in December, or January to February some Honourable Members have been receiving letters posted in October. That is on account of the arrears. The current postal arrangement has improved to a very great extent and I am sure on that account the Honourable Members should not have any cause for grievance. But so far as the arrears are concerned, it may take time to clear. I have given you the idea of money orders which were pending for delivery and you can imagine from this the huge number of letters waiting delivery. When I went to Sylhet I was told that out of these arrears that post office was receiving over 100,000 letters per day. Just imagine the arrears that were left behind. I would respectfully submit that no doubt the difficulties were very great, but I think I am right in saying that the improvement is also very great and is somewhat satisfactory. It would not be wholly satisfactory for some time as long as the people have not been trained properly. So far as R.M.S. section is concerned, which is a very important section of the postal service, for that training is essential.

There is another point to be considered. The post which goes from Karachi for Dacca has to pass through other territory. Similar is the case with the post which comes from Dacca. This includes inland telegrams also. It is possible that there are delays, postal delays, in delivery of letters and telegrams between Eastern and Western Pakistan. I am prepared to admit that. But we are responsible if the delay occurs in our territory, but so far as this in between territory is concerned, I cannot vouchsafe whether the attention will be paid so much to our post as it should be. I hope the Honourable Members will feel satisfied that there is some improvement as was said by Mr. Chakraverty. From 26th of October we have opened a Wireless Station. We had before this no connection with the outside world and our cables had to pass through India. It was certainly not a happy position. We are now connected with the whole of the world and our cables pass directly to the whole

[The Hon'ble Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar.]

of the world without passing through India. Wireless arrangements are already under negotiation and I hope that in the near future wireless stations will be installed and we will have wireless connections with the whole of the world without being dependent upon the Indian Dominion. So far as Karachi is concerned, we have arranged 600 telephone exchanges here for the Government, 100 extra telephones were given to the private people and other 300 telephones are going to be made available very soon because of the influx of various interests in Karachi who stand in need of telephones. The work has considerably increased and therefore we have to increase the staff. With the increase in work and the same number of staff, inefficiency is bound to result. Between Karachi and Lahore there were three telephone circuits and now we have got six. Between Karachi and Lahore there were only six telephone channels and now we have got 18. Similarly, so far as East Bengal is concerned, there were only six or seven places where trunk facilities were available and now six or seven more are added and five more are still under consideration. Dacca has been connected, I think, by three channels or two channels to Chittagong. Similarly Dacca is connected with Calcutta for Inter-Dominion service and telephonic arrangements are being remodelled in Lahore and because fortunately we had received some stores not from India but from outside.

Therefore, Sir, in view of these developments, I am sure Honourable Members will feel that something is being done and the Posts and Telegraphs people are not so lazy as some Honourable Members feel in the performance of their duties.

The Honourable Mr. Gazder made reference to certain cases in which certain individuals are alleged to have been given preference over others unjustifiably. If he will bring these facts to my notice, even by a letter, I will certainly look into them and if any injustice has been done or is being done, I may assure him that it will be set right. Sir, when I say that improvement has been effected, I may assure the Honourable House that I do not mean that the present state of affairs is wholly satisfactory. There is much to be done but all these improvements require time and they cannot be done over-night. It depends also on the possibilities of getting stores without which we can do nothing. I assure the Honourable Members of this House that I shall try my best to do what I can.

The Honourable Mr. Hamidul Haq Chowdhury : What about teleprinters ?

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : We are examining the question whether we should depend upon teleprinters or wireless arrangements and encourage the latter because it will be more speedy and probably more safe too.

Mr. Sris Chandra Chattopadhyaya (East Bengal : General) : Even ordinary telephone connections are not available in Dacca ; what about that ?

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : Well, I may point out that so far as telephone connections are concerned, I think different views are being expressed by different people. There is some wrong with it. Some people regard it to be satisfactory and some do not. I may point out that in America and England also where there is advanced system of telephones, some percentage of calls are missed. During the war this defect increased and it is quite natural some times people may not be able to get occasional calls. There the lines also are very limited and people rush to phone with a view to avoid going and meeting in person. This increases load on the line. Naturally

two people from two different localities cannot get connection with the same number at one and the same time. In Dacca, more connection have already been given; they have almost been doubled. Further increase is also under consideration.

Mr. Sris Chandra Chattopadhyaya : But we are not getting.

The Honourable Sardar Abdur Rab Khan Nishtar : If you yourself are not getting, then it is a different thing. If you, according to the rules that are observed by the administration in this respect, are entitled or for that matter any other member is entitled to get a phone connection, he will get it, provided lines are available. If he does not get it, he can bring the fact to my notice and I assure him that action will be taken in this respect and the person responsible for this will be taken to task.

Mr. Deputy President : Now, I must put the motion to vote. The question is :

“ That the demand under the head ‘ Pakistan Posts and Telegraphs Department ’ be reduced by Re. 1. ”

The motion was negatived.

Mr. Deputy President : The question is :

“ That the demand under the head ‘ Pakistan Posts and Telegraphs Department ’ be reduced by Rs. 100. ”

The motion was negatived.

Mr. Deputy President : Now, I will put the main motion to vote. The question is :

“ That sums not exceeding Rs. 2,36,12,000 and Rs. 4,40,20,000 be granted to the Governor-General to defray the charges which will come in course of payment respectively during the years ending on the 31st day of March, 1948, and 31st day of March, 1949, in respect of ‘ Pakistan Posts and Telegraphs Department ’. ”

The motion was adopted.

DEMAND NO. 9—CABINET

The Honourable Mr. Ghulam Mohammed (Minister for Finance) : Sir, I move :

“ That sums not exceeding Rs. 2,33,000 and Rs. 5,75,000 be granted to the Governor-General to defray the charges which will come in course of payment respectively during the years ending on the 31st day of March, 1948 and 31st day of March, 1949 in respect of ‘ Cabinet ’. ”

Mr. Deputy President : Motion moved :

“ That sums not exceeding Rs. 2,33,000 and Rs. 5,75,000 be granted to the Governor-General to defray the charges which will come in course of payment respectively during the years ending on the 31st day of March, 1948 and 31st day of March, 1949 in respect of ‘ Cabinet ’. ”

Now, Cut Motions.

Raising a discussion about the (a) general policy, (b) necessity of retrenchment and (c) working of the Development Board

Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta : (East Bengal : General) : Sir, I move :

“ That the demand under the head ‘ Cabinet ’ be reduced by Rs. 100. ”

Rising a discussion about the (a) general policy, (b) policy of the Government in making encroachment upon the Provincial spheres, (c) policy of ruling the country by Ordinances and Orders.

Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta : I further move, Sir :

“ That the demand under the head ‘ Cabinet ’ be reduced by Rs. 100. ”

[Mr. Dhirendra Nath Datta.]

Raising a discussion about the desirability of determining a ratio for minority community in the matter of appointments for Central Pakistan Government

Mr. Dhirendra Nath Datta : I also further move :

“ That the demand under the head ‘ Cabinet ’ be reduced by Rs. 100.”

Raising a discussion about the advisability of making laws so as to make all Demands for Grants subject to the vote of the Federal Legislature

Mr. Dhirendra Nath Datta : I further move, Sir :

“ That the demand under the head ‘ Cabinet ’ be reduced by Rs. 100.”

Discussion on general administration

Khan Abdul Ghaffar Khan (N.-W.F.P. : Muslim) : Sir, I move :

“ That the demand under the head ‘ Cabinet ’ be reduced by Rs. 100.”

Mr. Deputy President : The cut motions are now open to discussion.

***Mr. Dhirendra Nath Datta :** Sir, I do not want to detain the House much because the demands themselves speak for themselves. What I want to know from the Honourable the Finance Member, is that whether there has been any ratio fixed for the minority communities in the matter of appointment in the Central Government and I want further to know as to how many appointments have been made since 15th of August, 1947, in the Central Government, whether any appointments have gone to the minority communities or not. So far as Western Pakistan is concerned, excepting Sind, I hear that the exodus is now complete, but so far as Eastern Pakistan is concerned, there are still one crore and thirty lakhs of Hindus in the Eastern zone of Pakistan. The exodus there is very few in number. I feel, Sir, that exodus is also due to the economic causes and one of the economic causes is that they are being deprived of Government appointments. You know, Sir, that, so far as middle classes are concerned, Government appointments are the main source of the people. The ratio of appointments required for Hindus in Bengal was 50 per cent. and most of these appointments went to the Hindus in Eastern Bengal. So, Sir, I want to know the Government's policy in this matter by way of cut motion.

Then, Sir, I want to draw the attention of the House and if you read, Sir, the Budget demands, some of the demands are not subject to the votes of the legislature. We have obtained independence and it is full independence but I fail to understand, Sir, why the demands shall not be subject to the votes of Legislature.

The question of voting and non-voting does not arise. The pay of the Governor-General and of his staff shall be subject to the vote of the Legislature. No demand should remain non-voted now. You have made encroachments by means of Ordinances and you have amended the Government of India Act. We have the power to amend the Government of India Act and we shall amend it in such a way that all your demands should be subject to the votes of the Legislature.

Then, Sir, I have already said that there is a tendency to encroach upon the provincial revenues and I need not discuss it now as I have already discussed it during the general discussion of the Budget. I also object that the country should be governed by means of Ordinances and Orders under Section 9 of the Independence Act. Of course, the power has been given to the Governor-General to issue orders and that power is sought to be extended by another

[Mr. Dhirendra Nath Datta.]

administration of a country, but the responsibility is very great. I am not speaking now about Pakistan or the Indian Dominion but I am talking about the country as a whole. I must express my feeling that persons at high level who are responsible for the efficient administration of the country are driving the country to such a condition that the lot of the common man is becoming more miserable every day. I am afraid it will soon reach that stage when the limit of patience will be reached and the people will rise in revolution. They will be forced to do it. It is to that position that I wish to draw the attention of the Government. With these words, I move the cut motions for the acceptance of the House.

***Khan Abdul Ghaffar Khan:** Mr. Deputy President, Sir, my purpose in moving this cut motion is to say something before this Honourable House regarding Pakistan administration. I do not mean by this motion to run down the Government of Pakistan, nor to pick holes in it. In this connection, I desire also to throw some light on and remove the misunderstandings created against me and my group by responsible men of this Government and other non-officials of Pakistan.

First of all it is alleged that I and my group are the enemies of Pakistan and that we want to destroy it and cut it asunder. I do not want to argue, I may only say so much in this connection that I have thrown enough light on this point in my Province whenever I had an opportunity to speak. Still the responsible men of Pakistan have their misgivings as to whether I am a friend or a foe of Pakistan and that perhaps I wish to annihilate Pakistan. But they cannot deny that I have tried now and then to remove such misunderstandings. They are also aware that whenever I had an opportunity or was given one to address the people in different parts of our Province, I told them clearly that indeed I was of opinion and creed that India should not be divided because today in India we have witnessed the game—thousands, nay, lakhs of the young, old and children, men and women, were massacred and ruined. I admit that it was my honest opinion that India should not be divided; India should not be partitioned. But now that it is done, the dispute is over.

I delivered many speeches against the division of India, but the question is, has anybody listened to me? We said to the Muslim League Government in the Frontier, "We offer you a chance to carry on the Government". But the treatment meted out to the Pathans by the Government was tolerated only with great difficulty. People used to come to me to enquire about my future programme and asked, "What do you intend to do, since we cannot bear this state of affairs which has been created by Pakistan? We are they, who fought against a powerful nation of the World like that of the British who wanted to rob us". I explained to them that the situation of the British rule does not arise, as the question is different now. That was a foreign yoke and now the Muslims have their own Government. I repeatedly told the Pakistan Government that we are prepared to let you govern. Efforts were made to lead us to an internicine strife, because the "war-mongers" had hoped that as the struggle would proceed, the national and patriotic sentiments would at once be diverted towards it and the constructive work of the Government would stop. I realized the danger. You may hold any opinion about me but I am, not a man of destruction, but of construction. I am not a theoretical

year. I do not know whether it is the last instalment for the extension of his powers. This Legislature is the supreme body and it should rule the country and the Government should not have any power by means of Ordinances and Orders. This Constituent Assembly of Pakistan should have the right to rule the country. This power should not be transferred to somebody else.

Mr. Abdulla-al Mahmood : This Assembly is now functioning as a Legislature and it has got its restrictions and limitations.

***Mr. Dharendra Nath Datta :** I know all that and it is useless to discuss it with you now. I feel on this matter and that is why I have put in my amendments.

Before I resume my seat I want to say one thing. With regard to these cut motions, the general law of the Government of India during the bureaucratic days was that about 15 days were allotted for the discussion of the cut motions. I do not know why this time the period has been curtailed to three days only. We feel that we cannot have proper discussion in this short period. There are as many as 64 Demands and I am quite sure the majority of them will remain undiscussed. I want to know from the Government whether it is their policy to curtail the days for the discussion of the Demands for Grants and whether it will become a precedent for the future that only three days shall be allotted for this purpose.

Then, Sir, there is one thing more to which I would like to refer. Of course, this is a matter which will be dealt with under the trade policy of the Government. But I am afraid that demand may not be reached and so I feel it would be better to speak about the trade policy of the Government on this motion. What should be the trade policy of the Government? Of late, there have been trade barriers or rather a warfare is going on between the two Dominions at the cost of the poor consumers. I do not know whether the Government is fully aware of the situation that prevails in Eastern Bengal and Western Bengal. Sir, Bengal has been divided, but the trade centre continues to be Calcutta. People living in Eastern Bengal have got their connections with Calcutta which cannot be broken. If you go to Goalando or Faridpur or Chittagong, you will find that people are going from East Bengal to West Bengal. It is not only the Hindus but a large number of Muslims are also going to Calcutta because they do some business there. Even now this is happening. That is not the position in East Punjab or West Punjab. In my district you will find that there are families some members of which are in Pakistan and some are in the Indian Dominion. A large number of Mussalmans have got their agricultural lands in the districts of the West Bengal. In the district of Tipperah we depend on the supply of coal from West Bengal. In this district people also depend on West Bengal for the supply of cement and other building materials. They mainly depend for building material upon the Tipperah estate. In the whole of the Chittagong division, I mean the districts of Noakhali and Tipperah, people depend for their building material on the products of the Tipperah district. They get from there bamboos and the thatching. We, poor people, have not got roofed houses. So, for thatching purposes we use the thatching grass that is produced in the Tipperah estate. Because we have not been able to get these materials, it is impossible to describe to the House the immense difficulties that our people have to face. I feel, Sir, that it is Providence that gives responsibility to the people for the

but a practical man. If you study the whole of my life, you will find that I have devoted it for the welfare and progress of our country. I would say that the Khudai Khidmatgars was a social movement and not political, but it is a long story, consequently I do not want to repeat it. Who was responsible for converting this social movement into a political one? The British. Who associated us with the Congress? The British. It is not only here that I am mentioning it, but I have done so to the high-placed Britishers, as God has blessed me with courage.

We were blamed that the Khudai Khidmatgars—the slaves to Hindu gold—do not allow us to run the Government and work out the constructive programme, for such a programme can only proceed when there is peace in the whole country. But our attitude towards them was, and we proclaimed, that if the Government of Pakistan would work for our people and our country, then the Khudai Khidmatgars would be with them. I repeat that I am not for destruction of Pakistan. In destruction lies no use for Hindus, Muslims, the Frontier, the Punjab, Bengal or even Sind. Advantage, there is only in construction. I want to tell you a very plain thing that I will not support any body in destruction. If any constructive programme is before you, if you want to do something constructive for our people, not in theory but in practice, I declare it before this Honourable House that I and my people are at your service. (*Cheers*).

For about seven months I have been watching the administration of Pakistan, but I could not find any difference between this administration and that of the British. I may be wrong, but it is the common view. I, alone, do not say so; if you go and ask the poor, then my views will be confirmed. It may be that you suppress their voice with force. But remember, that force or power does not last long. Force can merely serve the purpose for the time being. If you will oppress the people, it will develop hatred against you in their hearts. Leave it aside, I tell you that there is more corruption today than it was during the British rule, and now there is more unrest than it was in the British regime. It is possible that you may doubt my intentions. But my speech is not destructive. I have come here in the capacity of a friend, please think over the facts I am placing before you. If you find them useful for Pakistan, well and good, otherwise throw them into the waste paper basket. Why did we fight against the British? We fought to turn them out, so that the country be ours and we may rule over it. Now we have taken over the country from the British, but we find today more Englishmen than they were under the old regime; rather more Englishmen are being called in from outside. Today unfortunately we observe the same old policy, the same old method whether in the Frontier or the Tribal Area. We do not see any change in it. I am very sorry to say that our Hindu brethren have appointed Indian Governors in their Provinces and not even men but a woman also can become a Governor there. Were there no Musalmans in Bengal or the Punjab who could become our Governors? I have to say, that to our misfortune, the British whom we had turned out have again been brought in and placed at our heads. Is this Islamic Fraternity? Would we call it a brotherhood? This is Islamic Pakistan! It is not the only evil in the administration, but there is another, and that is, the same ordinance laws issued by the Government. That, which gives me most pain, is to see that when any communique is issued by the Frontier Government, it is in the same old way, the same old language and in the same old spirit as was peculiar to the British Raj. If an Englishman

[Khan Abdul Ghaffar Khan.]

told a lie, he was a foreigner. He had not come here for our reform and betterment. He came to exploit us. He came to achieve his own ends. But I have nothing to complain against the British. Now, I have, indeed a complaint against Pakistan, because they are our brothers and that Government is our Government. We should now leave the old British tactics. If we would follow the old methods, I may tell you that Pakistan, which we have achieved through so many difficulties, would be lost to our hands. There is another thing that I wish to tell you. That is, I have often been charged with infusing among the Pathans a feeling of separate nationality and creating provincialism. In reality, if you see, you will find that you are the creators of this provincialism. To us, the Pathans, these things are unknown. We do not know what provincialism is? My own experience of provincialism is, that it does not exist among the Pathans. Take the case of Sind. Have we created provincialism in Sind? The problem is, how provincialism is created? It may be that you misguide the people for some time in the name of Islam, but you cannot push this matter too long. It will be a temporary thing—instable. I wish to put the question, "who created these conditions and why?" In this world one thing is a cause, the other is effect. It is the law of nature that nothing comes into existence without a cause and consequently such circumstances did not develop, *ipso facto*.

*The Honourable Mr. Liaquat Ali Khan (Prime Minister and Minister for Defence): They have been created.

†Khan Abdul Ghaffar Khan: I wish to tell that the more you will pursue the matter, the greater would be unpleasantness. I do not want to create bitterness. You know my nature, I do not make speeches. I am doing so for the first time and that too, with the object of acquainting you with my ideas, of which you were ignorant till now. I do not want to go deep into the matter. Why is there provincialism in Sind? Has it been created by the Pathans?

At the time of his visit to Peshawar, our Muslim League brothers also put before our Prime Minister the same thing which we used to say. But he said that he wants to unite all the Mussalmans from Khyber to Chittagong. Who can deny this? But our point is that on the one hand you want to unite all the Mussalmans from Khyber to Chittagong, and on the other, what objection can you have against our constituting a belt of all the Pathans who were disunited by the British and how far is it against Islam? If you help us in this connection, you unite us and make a powerful State of ours and after this State is established, whose strength it would be?

*The Honourable Mr. Ghazanfar Ali Khan (Minister for Refugees and Rehabilitation): This is against Islam!

†Malik Mohammad Firoz Khan Noon: (West Punjab): Muslim And you will join Afghanistan.

†Khan Abdul Ghaffar Khan: I wish to tell you frankly, that we can only join you and not Afghanistan. You have greater claim on us than Afghanistan.

Different charges are brought against the Pathans. Sometimes it is said that they are not true Muslims. It is strange that those, who are passing an Islamic life, they are styled as Hindus and those who have no concern with Islam are now labelled as Mussalmans!

•English translation of interruption in Urdu.

†English translation of Urdu Speech.

What a calamity, which seems unavoidable ! There has been a tremendous revolution within six months ! There is a separate Hindu Government in Hindustan and a distinct Government of the Musalmans in Pakistan. When it is possible that our Bengalee brothers living at a distance of two thousand miles from Khyber to Chittagong, could be one with us, join Pakistan and be our brothers, then why cannot our own brothers, the Pathans, who are so near to us and whom the British disrupted for their own purpose because the union of the Pathans would be a source of danger to them. How can they be the cause of danger to you ? The British, who came here with a view to rule, created discord amongst us on their own selfish motive. But you are our brothers, why do you fear us ?

*The Honourable Mr. Liaquat Ali Khan : Please elucidate your point.

†Khan Abdul Ghaffar Khan : What does our Pathanistan mean, I will tell you just now ? You see, that the people inhabiting this Province are called Sindhis and the name of their country is Sind. Similarly, the Punjab or Bengal is the land of the Punjabees or Bengalees. In the same way there is the North-West Frontier. We are one people and ours is a land. Within Pakistan we also want that the mere mentioning of the name of the country should convey to the people that it is the land of Pakhtoon. Is it a sin under the tenets of Islam ?

*The Honourable Mr. Liaquat Ali Khan : Is Pathan the name of a country or that of a community ?

†Khan Abdul Ghaffar Khan : Pathan is the name of the community and we will name the country as Pakhtoonistan. I may also explain that the people of India used to call us Pathans and we are called Afghans by the Persians. Our real name is Pakhtoon. We want Pakhtoonistan, and want to see all the Pathans on this side of the Durand Line joined and united together in Pakhtoonistan. You help us in this. If you think it un-Islamic, then I would say that it is just Islam. If you argue, that Pakistan would be weakened by it, then I would say that it is not so. Pakistan can never become weak by the creation of a separate political unit. On the other hand, it would become stronger. Most of the difficulties are begotten by lack of confidence, but when there is confidence the difficulties are resolved. Governments are run on good faith and not on mistrust.

Mr. Deputy President : Today being Friday and we are rising at 12-30 the Honourable Member has taken more than his time but I am prepared to allow him more time. Will the Honourable Member be able to finish his speech by 12-30 ?

†Khan Abdul Ghaffar Khan : Yes, Sir, I will finish within time.

The other thing is that people invite us to join the Muslim League. I think the Muslim League has done its duty. Its work, its object and its function was to get Pakistan. Pakistan has been created. I mean to say that now it has been achieved, there does not remain any need of Muslim League now. There should be other parties in our country. A party should be organised here on economic basis, so that all may join together and there remains no opposition. Regarding

*English translation of interruption in Urdu.

†English translation of Urdu speech.

[Khan Abdul Ghaffar Khan.]

this I will say only this much that Parties on economic lines should be organised in Pakistan to do away with the existing differences, and then if there will be any differences amongst us we will be able to remove by sitting together to discuss them. Islam is a religion, in which there is the greatest toleration, and when we will exchange our views then we would have to tolerate one another; not that I should oppose any body if he disagrees with me.

As the time is short, I will point out one more thing and then finish my speech. Pakistan is a poor country. The question is how to carry on the Government of this poor country? If I am poor, what should I do? Should I live within my means or otherwise? Or should I live like the rich? When it is admitted, that Pakistan is a poor country, then the system of its Government should not be like that of the capitalists. There should be no aristocratic grandeur. You want to impose taxes, do it please, but keep in view the condition of the poor. But again the question is, have we to live according to our means or according to the status of the rich. We have to find out as to how to run the State of Pakistan. We have before us the traditions of our early predecessors. The way is there. We should follow it. We should have the resolution to sacrifice, to tread the same path. Our great religious heads who built the Islamic Empire were only three. Unless we follow these leaders in their moral character, spirit of sacrifice and feelings of sympathy, we cannot help our State to grow great. The name of Hazrat Ali is familiar to you. Whatever he did, was for Islam and for the people. It was according to some principle. It is said that once an opponent of Hazrat Ali, on being unmanly by him in a duel, spat at his face. At once Hazrat Ali let him go, as taking his life then would have involved a personal grudge. This should be the spirit. Now, take the life of Hazrat Abu Bakr. Even before he was a Caliph, whatever he did was for the Musalmans alone. He himself got a meagre allowance as a Caliph and fixed an equal amount for all other Musalmans. There is a charge against Islam that there is no equality of treatment in it. He however maintained that the necessities of life are the same for all. A man may be poor or rich but still the necessities of life of the two are the same. All have children. Therefore the necessities of all are similar, not as you say, that your wants are greater and ours less. And you can not say that a poor man has no prospects to become rich, while the rich has. These matters relate to culture and civilization, and there should not be any differentiation in them, as the physical wants of all are alike, their allowances should also be equal. Similar was the case with Hazrat Umar. The Muslim Empire which lasted so long was built by these two men, Hazrat Abu Bakr and Hazrat Umar. You may be aware of the fact that even if a poor man stood to criticise him, Hazrat Umar never threatened him and was never angry with him. And when he had finished, then the Hazrat tried to satisfy him by giving out true facts and also encouraged him. Under the leadership and guidance of such men, the Muslims can never go astray. If you develop the same morals, then your Empire can also become equally strong. When they were elected Caliphs and the question of their pays arose, they themselves gave the decision by saying, "I am a servant of the Musalmans and I should be paid the wages given to any labourer in Medira". That is why I say that if Pakistan is poor, we should run it on such principle. Whose is Pakistan? It is ours. If it is poor, we should run it like a poor country and when, tomorrow, Pakistan will be rich then we may run it in an aristocratic way. I will say that with its present ways or system of Government, Pakistan cannot become rich. Therefore the old order should change and we should revert to

the old Islamic way of life. We oppose it, not simply because the British did it; but if it is done here in the name of Islam, it shall not have our approval. I will certainly support the Government of Pakistan, if it is run on Islamic lines. My idea of Pakistan is, that it should be an Azad Pakistan. We do not want that it should be under influence of a particular community or individual. We want that Pakistan should be for all its people, that all should enjoy equally and that it should not be exploited by a handful of people. We want that the Government of Pakistan should be in the hands of its people. As far as technical experts are concerned, Pakistan should send for them from other countries like America and England. But as regards administration, I cannot agree that Pakistan is devoid of capable men and all are inefficient here. When Hindus could manage their affairs, cannot we do the same? I like the idea of having the whole administration of Pakistan in the hands of its people. I have heard that many Englishmen have been retained in service here and fresh ones are coming in. I must say that this will not be for the good of Pakistan.

Mr. Deputy President : The House stands adjourned till 11 A.M. tomorrow, the 6th instant.

The Assembly then adjourned till Eleven of Clock, on Saturday, the 6th March, 1948.